

Anna Krajewska, Stefan Krajewski

EFFECTIVENESS OF THE REFORMED MANAGEMENT SYSTEM

1. Microeconomic effectiveness. Formulation of problem

One of the main aims of the reform is to introduce efficiently operating levers and mechanisms promoting effectiveness to the economy. There are well known shortcomings and weaknesses of the previous systems solutions revealing themselves in the form of irrational economic management in many areas.

At the foundations of previous systems solutions, there lay a false - in our opinion - thesis, which was neither theoretically nor practically justified that enterprises display a very limited ability to operate effectively. It must have provided a basis for formation and existence during many years of a system in which economic autonomy of enterprises was insignificant and the main burden of operational management was carried by the Centre. It was the activity of the Centre due to weakness of enterprises in this field that was to ensure economic effectiveness and rationality for the national economy.

No matter how different systems solutions are applied in practice, we can observe a desire of employees and their teams to secure for themselves a satisfactory income for their work. It was attempted to fulfil this desire in ways which did not require big involvement and effort of personnel by utilizing shortcomings and incohesion of systems solutions. A trend towards ensuring "by all means" appropriate remuneration for employees appearing in enterprises was considered to be the basic obstacle on the way of creating an appropriate motivation system. The same trend was treated as the main cause restricting abilities of enterprises to operate autonomously and effectively. Accordingly, in the accepted systems solutions attempts were made generally to suppress or at least neutralize these appearing /autonomous/ goals of personnel.

Effectiveness of economic management may be discussed in its micro-economic approach /employee, enterprise/ and in macro-economic approach. A criterion of effectiveness is a derivative of activity of particular economic units.

We shall accept here that goals of activity of employees may be formulated as follows:

1. to obtain a satisfactory income from work - in comparison with incomes obtained in other enterprises, occupations, sectors of the economy;
2. to satisfy non-material needs, obtain satisfaction and fulfil aspirations connected with performed work, and get satisfying widely understood working conditions /among others, in the field of work safety and hygiene, onerousness, intensity, interhuman relations, possibilities and prospects of promotion etc./.

Employees' goals exert an influence on the enterprise's goals although its goal cannot represent a simple sum or a resultant of individual goals. Within the enterprise, there are colliding both individual interests /of particular employees/, the personnel as a whole, as well as general social interests transmitted to the enterprise from the Centre. Thus, the enterprise becomes a trustee of both individual interests and general social interests. The Centre shaping and modifying systems solutions may, to some although limited degree, exert its influence on the content of the enterprise's goal. We accept, however, that this content is, to a large extent, determined by a desire of the personnel to attain an optimal /and thus, taking into account the effort of the personnel/ income from work per one employee. According to the character of the system /based on commands and centralized allocations, decentralized-self-management, decentralized-managerial/ different groups within the enterprise may, to a smaller or bigger extent, impose their preferences on the entire personnel. Solutions accepted in the system of management determine also what ways of goal accomplishment will be recognized as attractive and which will be treated as difficult, of small usefulness, not worth undertaking. Systems solutions should induce enterprises to the undertaking of activities compatible with the general social interest, and

create barriers and impediments for activities incompatible with this interest. Activities being effective for the enterprise should be simultaneously effective from the viewpoint of the entire economy.

Long practice has revealed ineffectiveness of attempts at suppression or ignoring microeconomic goals, which lead inevitably to decay of initiative springing from the rank and file, which cannot be replaced by activities of the Centre. They also lead inevitably to intensification of negative phenomena in the system of functioning and in the economic practice, which have not been predicted or intended and which appear as a result of a clash of official solutions with covertly operating informal rules of behaviour born by activities of different economic units striving to accomplish their autonomous goals.

2. Accomplishment of employees' microeconomic goals in conditions of the economic reform

Our analysis of the problem of accomplishment of microeconomic goals and ways of achieving them will begin with a statement that the reform has provided enterprises with big real autonomy in the shaping of means for remuneration and in distribution of these means /including their rights to introduce their own experimental wage systems/.¹ Growth rate of wages over the years 1982-1983 was very high in comparison with indices attained in previous years. It is difficult, however, to give an explicit evaluation of this phenomenon since it was occurring in very specific conditions of acute crisis, low production level, drop in employment, drastic lowering of living standards in 1982, inflationary phenomena appearing on an unprecedented scale. It is easy to understand that in conditions of unparalleled growth of prices and drop in living standards, employees tend to exert their pressure on growth of nominal wages. Intensification of this pressure although quite considerable is, however, not /at least in the opinion of the management in enterprises under study/ a basic factor promoting growth of wages. Also according to the opinion of prof. Cz. Bobrowski "data compiled by the Consultative Economic Council indicate that increases in wages carried out on the

strength of enterprises' own decisions constituted but an insignificant part of the overall growth of the population's incomes. Pricing decisions played here a decisive role... The report of the Council proves that the index of remuneration for improved labour productivity in 1983 should be treated as absolutely normal".²

Findings of studies conducted on a sample of enterprises indicate that contrary to numerous suppositions the reform does not pave the way for any more pronounced increase of wage differentiation among enterprises. Enterprises situated on further levels of wage hierarchy are "heaved up" by various means /most often with active coparticipation of superior authorities/ to the level of the average wage. Consequently, more clearly than "ruthlessness and predacity" of the reform, there can be seen a protective role of the Centre.

Quite considerable fluctuations in labour productivity levels in particular enterprises and big differences in labour productivity dynamics among enterprises could be seen in the last few years. These fluctuations were largely affected by external conditions being independent of enterprises /supplies of raw materials, energy, spare parts, access to hard currency/. Attempts at comparison of the rate of changes in labour productivity and the rate of changes in wages show that in most enterprises there are no correlations between these categories. In many instances, a big decline in labour productivity is accompanied by a faster growth of wages or wages may be falling when productivity grows. Neither did different studies confirm distinct correlations between levels of labour productivity or wages and profitability of enterprises.

In line with assumptions of the reform, a considerable part of employees remuneration may come from rewards paid out from the obtained profit. In the course of our studies, we tried to determine whether in the course of profit distribution there appear trends to giving preference to funds of consumption character and especially to reward fund. Analysis of the compiled statistical data affords a conclusion that such a distinct trend does not appear. At most, we can observe here certain consumption trends in the case of some /very few/ enterprises. Both in 1982 and 1983, in a prevailing part of enterprises, most resources

coming from the profit were earmarked for expansion of the development fund.

3. Pro- and antieffectiveness aspects of enterprises' activity

3.1. Volume and structure of production

Both solutions provided by the reform and the economic policy create stimuli for production growth. It is most visible in construction of deductions for the State Fund of Professional Activation. These stimuli exert a tremendous impact on the personnel. Another observation that could be made here is that there is a widespread conviction in enterprises that production should be increased in order to enable the personnel to obtain higher wages. The findings of our studies indicate that modifications of wage systems carried out in enterprises are oriented, to a big degree, at promotion of production growth. The solutions being introduced aim at utilization of the existing reserves of production growth /to a large extent, these are reserves which were formed in the period of the economic crisis/. The biggest possibilities of production growth are possessed by these enterprises in which reserves in productive capacities had existed before 1980, the biggest production drop took place in the years 1980-1981, investment projects started in the seventies were completed recently which led to expansion of their productive capacities, or enterprises in which there exist substantial employment reserves. The fact that there are created strong stimuli to activation of simple, easy to mobilize reserves of production growth should be assessed positively. Simultaneously, however, it should not be forgotten that systems solutions aggravated the situation of enterprises, which entered the reform without any reserve productive capacities and employment, while the findings of our studies do not provide any arguments allowing to state that in the policy of reliefs /connected, first of all, with the State Fund of Professional Activation/ the Centre makes any attempts to equalize wage effects of unequal conditions of the start.

The main impediment to growth of production is shortage of raw materials and spare parts, decapitalization of fixed assets,

and employment deficit. Most of these constraints appeared independently of the reform solutions. We believe that the reform solutions oriented at production growth allowed to reduce, to a big extent, negative consequences of these constraints. Accordingly, enterprises availing themselves of their rights to determine autonomously their production structure introduce elastically indispensable corrections adjusted to the current supply, employment situation, or possibilities of their productive capacities. We are putting forward a hypothesis that centralized determination of the assortment structure of production through directives would lead to decrease of the level of production /i.e. lower than the present one/ and its worse adaptation to needs taking into account the existing constraints. We also suppose that negative consequences of decapitalization and disproportions in productive capacities might be mitigated quite considerably if enterprises obtained bigger investment opportunities than it is the case today.

System solutions do not provide an effective motivation for modernization of the structure of production. In majority of assortment groups, the products manufactured hitherto find easy sales despite the fact that their quality is often quite poor. This is largely due to lack of the market equilibrium and competition, while preferences /e.g. in industrial supplies, credits or wages/ for market-oriented production do not exist or are very weak.

3.2. Export and import

Restriction of ties between Polish enterprises and abroad observed in the last few years is not so much a consequence of the reform but rather of the economic crisis. Opportunities of autonomous development of relations with abroad much bigger than before, which have been created by the reform, are not utilized in practice.

So far, it has proved impossible to create an effective mechanism promoting export-oriented production, especially in the manufacturing industry. Not demanding and very absorptive domestic market, unstable supply situation, frequently changing economic rules, difficulties with obtaining an appropriate qua-

lity of production and absence of bigger economic benefits all hamper creation of a strong proexport pressure. In this situation, the biggest stimulating effectiveness is attained by the mechanism contained in the calculus of hard currency deductions being especially attractive for enterprises whose normal functioning requires supplementary imports /besides basic raw materials imported centrally/. The research findings point at a much smaller effectiveness of reliefs in deductions for the State Fund of Professional Activation in virtue of export, and of rewards for export remaining at the disposal of the Ministry of Foreign Trade.

In majority of enterprises, export revenues are detached from transaction prices /selling of goods to foreign trade organizations, which makes it very difficult for producers to keep the calculus of economic effectiveness of export... The entire system of stimuli for export is oriented rather at its growth than at its effectiveness.

Within the last few years, there has been largely restricted import, and especially from the hard currency zone. This does not remain in any closer relationship with operation of the reform mechanism. It is our opinion, however, that owing to the reform mechanism /and primarily, owing to autonomy of enterprises in determining their volume and structure of production/ the economy managed to adapt itself faster and better to import constraints than it would have been possible within an unreformed system of its functioning.

3.3. Costs of production

So far it has been difficult to perceive any more pronounced trend towards reduction of production costs. This must result from the already mentioned external determinants affecting activity of enterprises /seller's market, monopolistic situation, influence of enterprises on prices/. The practice shows that in conditions of nonparametric prices, producers may in a vast majority of cases count on acceptance in their prices of practically all costs incurred by them. Introduction of a category of the so-called justified costs does not play a role of a real instrument generating proeffectiveness activity in this situation.

On the positive side, it should be noted that enterprises more and more often begin to keep a reliable recording of costs for their internal needs. They may be reckoning here with the fact that in the future it will really become necessary to institute measures aiming at reduction of costs.

In practice, there do not operate any mechanisms leading to elimination of enterprises with the highest costs of production. Neither are there any indications that the system of operational programmes, government orders, guarantees and preferences in procurement of industrial goods releases mechanisms promoting reduction of production costs and giving preference to enterprises showing the best economic performance. In the years 1982 and 1983, material- and energy-intensity of the economy was steadily growing. This trend was somewhat slowed down at the end of this period but it is hard to say whether it will be a long-term trend.

3.4. Utilization of productive capacities

The degree of utilization of productive capacities in the Polish economy was sharply diminished at the turn of the seventies and the eighties as a result of the crisis situation. This found also its confirmation in the enterprises analyzed by us. From mid-1982, mechanisms of the economic reform led to some growth in production volume and labour productivity but that did not contribute, to any bigger degree, to better utilization of productive capacities. The following factors were mainly at work here: drop in employment /forced out, first of all, by earlier-than-normal retirement and child-care leaves/, deficit of raw materials and spare parts, deepening of disproportions in structure of manufacturing capacities due to freeze and disturbances in investment programmes.

The reform did not succeed in releasing all the existing potential possibilities of more effective utilization of productive capacities. The level of investments launched by particular enterprises continues to be quite low, and this might contribute to better utilization of productive capacities. It is hard to blame enterprises for this situation since their efforts to expand their production activities are often hindered

by impediments and constraints in obtaining credits, as well as by lack of any possibility of purchasing necessary machinery and equipment.

The capital market does not operate and there are not set up any joint or mixed enterprises. In very few cases do enterprises undertake joint ventures, which might lead to growth of production and better utilization of productive capacities.

3.5. Employment

Employment should be counted among these areas in which it was hoped that the reform would bring fast and positive results /hence, among others, the concept of earlier retirement and 3-year child-care leaves/. The results scored so far prove to be insignificant. Drop in employment does not result from mechanisms introduced by the reform but it is, first of all, forced by employees benefiting from earlier retirement and child-care leaves. Neither can there be seen any positive changes in the structure of employment. Our studies show that decline in employment of workers is more pronounced than in the case of remaining employees. Moreover, quite a significant drop in employment can be seen in research and development sphere.

There can hardly be observed any efforts made by enterprises to rationalize their employment - no signs can be seen of "pushing out" redundant workers from enterprises or of decreased demand for labour. It can be commonly seen that enterprises strive to increase their employment. This situation testifies that enterprises /and especially, decision-making bodies/ are convinced that for different reasons it is beneficial to conduct economic activity having at the disposal some reserve in employment. This argument points to a weakness in the reform solutions but it may be also pointing at lack of confidence in success of the reform /on the other hand, a reserve in employment is maintained just in case the former rules were to return - it is well known that possessing an appropriate labour reserve is an important element in the enterprise's strategy in the system based on commands and centralized allocations/.

3.6. Development activity

Development activity was restrained in enterprises in the last few years, which was largely a result of constraints imposed on central investments. On the other hand, propensity of enterprises to undertake financial activity from their own resources and credits is quite big. Apprehension expressed earlier that big autonomy of enterprises in distribution of their profit would lead to preference given to funds of consumer kind and, especially, to the fund of rewards has not been confirmed. Analysis of statistical data collected in the course of our studies indicates the absence of any marked trend in this area. In a vast majority of enterprises, a substantial portion of profit is earmarked for expanding the development fund /this does not imply automatically that enterprises possess plentiful resources for investments as many enterprises utilize a considerable portion of their development fund for repayment of investment credits contracted in the seventies/. Demand for credits in enterprises is quite big although moderate in most cases. We think that the managerial personnel in enterprises has finally become fully aware that in conditions of the reform all credits must be fully repaid from revenues, which prompts enterprises to keep a very honest calculus of economic effectiveness as concerns utilization of these credits. Development trends in enterprises are restricted and weakened by bureaucratic, formal constraints in access to credits imposed by banks pursuing a policy of tough money.

Mechanisms of the reform have not led so far to generation of innovation propensity in enterprises. There are maintained and sometimes even intensified the main negative determinants of innovation activity, which had existed before the reform was introduced. They include seller's market, monopolistic position held by domestic suppliers accompanied by very weak anti-trust measures, influence of producers on prices, lack of distinct correlation between employees' income situation and their innovation activity.

Reduction of investment allocations /including drastic reduction of import of modern machines, equipment, and know-how/ largely restricted possibilities of commissioning big invest-

ment projects. The maintained weakness of economic stimuli of innovations induces autonomous enterprises to seeking savings among others through cutting their expenditure on research and development activity. Material equipment of research and development units is steadily deteriorating, employment drops fast along with pay. In this situation, very often employees with high qualifications and big experience leave as they can find more attractive work in other sectors. This leads to a negative selection of personnel and weakens the research and development sector for a long time. It is all the more disturbing as rebuilding of this sector and equipping it with an appropriate staff will most certainly be a difficult and long process.

Faced with difficulties connected with decapitalization of fixed assets, deficit of raw materials and spare parts, as well as employees working directly in production, the research and development sector, to a growing extent, switches its operations to search for substitute technologies and raw materials /often worse than those previously applied/, deals with production of deficit spare parts, partly takes over duties of tool-room workers etc. This is undoubtedly necessary in the present conditions and rational from the point of view of enterprises as it allows to shift the appearing barriers to growth of production /whose high technical level is no longer an indispensable condition of selling goods in the domestic market or, at least, most assortment groups/. However, in the long run such a situation may lead to greater technical backwardness of our economy. In the present situation, it is difficult to introduce new products and technologies being important for modernization of the structure of the national economy. The negative effects already appear in the form of growing difficulties in export of the manufacturing industry products. It may even prove to be a difficult task to maintain the technical standard of some groups of products being of crucial importance for the country's economy.

The economic reform has not contributed so far to elaboration and to effective operation of mechanisms allowing for the central steering of innovations. This situation might be briefly summarized as follows: before the reform there were no effective mechanisms of "sucking" innovations by enterprises, while, on

the other hand, some attempts were made to "pressing" them - today, neither mechanisms of "pressing" nor "sucking" operate.

4. Macroeconomic effectiveness

How can a system, which generates the activities presented above, be evaluated? To what extent, should such a system be considered effective, ensuring high effectiveness of economic management on the macroeconomic scale - especially when compared with the previous system? It is certainly too early to give an answer to these questions supported by proper arguments due to a short time within which the new system has been operating and the specific, crisis situation of the economy. Nonetheless, there already exist certain prerequisites allowing its initial evaluation.

As a criterion of effectiveness of the system of management we shall accept its ability: to generate selectively specific and desirable economic phenomena, to balance the economy, to promote innovations, and to integrate people performing different social roles in enterprises for a harmonious accomplishment of enterprises' tasks.³

4.1. Selectiveness of management instruments

The instruments of management system are effective if they are able to generate definite and desirable economic phenomena and eliminate others, which are undesirable. This property of management instruments is often called their selectiveness. Selective instruments of the management system must be, thus, adapted to a concrete situation and they must enable execution of general social goals obtaining preference at a given moment.

Results of the economic reform evaluated from this point of view are quite differentiated and oftentimes unsatisfactory. In the period of its introduction, priority was given to the following goals: growth of production, restructuralization of the economy /mainly through growth of production of consumer goods and export/, reduction of costs /especially, material costs/, effective utilization of labour resources, restoration of equilibrium, and technical progress.

The most visible results were attained in the field of production growth /but also in this field, expansion of enterprises was hampered by such instruments as deductions from profit for the State Fund of Professional Activation, and progressive income tax/, growth of export /with, however, a lower effectiveness of instruments in stimulation of export in the manufacturing sector/, and restoration of equilibrium. In the remaining areas, the employed instruments were operating much less effectively. For example, there are not operating effectively instruments oriented at a fuller utilization of productive capacities in enterprises with a modern production profile and low costs, as well as those instruments aiming at curbing production in obsolete enterprises operating ineffectively. Among others, such instruments as operational programmes, government orders, and credit policy have not been utilized properly here.

Insufficient selectiveness of management instruments is confirmed among others by the fact that almost all enterprises have become profitable, solvent, and possess ability of contracting credit in conditions created by the reform. What is more, the findings of studies point at an increasingly more pronounced trend towards equalization of the rate of profitability among various enterprises. And this happens despite the fact that activities of enterprises in the real sphere do not provide any distinct arguments for equalization of their financial situation.

Another trend, which can be observed, is that towards excessive expansion and complication of the management system mainly through creation of an unnecessarily high number of priorities and reliefs. It carries a threat of "over-regulation" and, consequently, of weakening cohesion and appearance of internal conflicts in essential elements of the system.

4.2. Economic equilibrium

A fundamental weakness of systems solutions existing before 1982 was their inability to develop effective mechanisms of economic equilibrium due to creation of excessive demand, which was not synchronized with supply capacities /we are analyzing here not only consumer demand but also procurement-investment

demand for raw materials, machines, hard currency, labour etc./.

In its assumptions, the reform contains mechanisms curbing the creation of excessive demand both at the microeconomic and macroeconomic levels.

The mechanisms, which were to be operative at the microeconomic level, are associated primarily with autonomy of enterprises, enhanced role of the economic calculus, and a principle subordinating the income situation in enterprises to their long-term effectiveness. Effectiveness of these mechanisms will depend, however, largely on the fact to what extent the Centre:

- firstly - will consistently exact implementation of the self-financing principle from enterprises;
- secondly - will manage to elaborate appropriate principles of the credit policy and will be able to enforce repayment of credits contracted by enterprises;
- thirdly - will be pursuing a policy of budgetary constraints /tough money/.

At the macroeconomic level, hopes for the curbing of excessive demand should be linked with changes in functions of the central authorities, abandoning of predominance of branch systems and socialization of the central planning.

The achievements scored in this field so far indicate, however, that we continue to be at the beginning of a path leading to equalization of the economy. It largely results from the fact that the past negative phenomena /from before the reform/ affect strongly the present situation. Nonetheless, an important cause of such slow changes is also poor effectiveness of the reform mechanisms, and mainly shortcomings of the credit policy, continued lack of close relationships between the income situation of enterprises and their effectiveness, expanded system of reliefs and priorities, and tendencies to continue central investment programmes from the seventies. Restructuralization of the economy proceeds very slowly, and growth of prices and not expansion of production size play the main role in the process of restoring the market equilibrium.

4.3. Innovativeness of the system

An important criterion of effectiveness of the management system is ability to mobilize strong and effective mechanisms promoting innovations in the economy. It is especially important in the present situation of the Polish economy, which has at its disposal tremendous reserves while simultaneously it is deprived of any bigger investment capacities.

As it was already said, the reform failed to bring any improvement in the sphere of innovativeness of the economy and even some regress can be observed here. The system of the central steering of the innovation activity existing before the reform has been weakened, while a new system has not been developed. There continue to be absent /perhaps to an even bigger extent than before/ general conditions promoting innovativeness /monopolization, seller's market, and manipulation of prices by enterprise are preserved/. In this situation, enterprises are able to achieve a favourable income situation without necessity of making innovation-oriented efforts. Simultaneously, financial and material resources for the innovation activity /especially those coming from import/ have been cut.

4.4. Ability to integrate

Ability to integrate employees and whole personnel in the process of accomplishing goals of economic organizations is one of fundamental criteria determining effectiveness of the management system. The assumptions of the economic reform contain mechanisms allowing to achieve a much higher degree of integration than it was possible with systems solutions applied previously. It is connected with the process of socialization of planning, enhanced role played by trade unions and workers' self-management, and considerable autonomy of enterprises whose economic-financial system, according to the assumptions of the reform, should be constructed in a way allowing to generate a strong employees' motivation to undertaking activities compatible with the social interest.

However, socio-political developments caused that the reform was being introduced in conditions of a deep social disintegra-

tion with operation of workers' councils being suspended similar to operation of trade unions, which was first suspended, and next trade unions were liquidated. A sharp deterioration of the economic situation also disintegrates different socio-professional groups in their struggle to obtain their proper share of resources, which have been quite modest in the last few years. It also puts into motion bargaining procedures.

In practice, due to the weakening of the role played by trade unions and workers' self-management there could be observed a certain retreat from the self-management aspect of the reform accompanied by consolidation of the managerial trend. Neither could the existing economic-financial system of enterprises, contrary to expectations, ensure desirable harmony between activities of employees in particular enterprises with general social objectives. Employees can still accomplish their goals by means incompatible with the general interest. All this causes that the degree of integration of activities continues to be insufficient.

References

1. Conclusions presented in this paper have been formulated on the basis of the studies carried out in 1982 and 1983 by the staff of the Institute of Political Economy, University of Lodz in 49 industrial enterprises. The findings of these studies were presented in two reports: Analysis of Introduction of the Economic Reform in Light, Heavy, and Electromechanical Industries /in Polish/ - a report on studies conducted under scientific supervision of prof. dr. hab. J. Mujzel, the Institute of Political Economy, University of Lodz, Lodz, December 1982; and Analysis of Introduction of the Economic Reform in Industrial Companies /in Polish/, the Institute of Political Economy, University of Lodz, Lodz, December 1983.
2. "Around the Hammer Theory" /in Polish/, interview with prof. Cz. Bobrowski, *Życie Gospodarcze*, No. 42, 1983.
3. We accept such criteria of effectiveness of the management system after J. Beksia, *Criteria of Effectiveness of the Management System* /in Polish/, *Życie Gospodarcze*, 1977, No 27.

Anna Krajewska, Stefan Krajewski.

Efektywność reformowanego systemu zarządzania

Podjmując problem efektywności reformowanego systemu zarządzania Autorzy rozpatrują go przede wszystkim w skali mikro i na podstawie przeprowadzonej analizy przechodzą do oceny efektywności w skali makro. W opracowaniu silnie uwypuklona jest teza, że przedsiębiorstwo posiada własne autonomiczne cele działania, które nie powinny być przez rozwiązania systemowe ignorowane, lecz świadomie wykorzystywane. Ignorowanie celów autonomicznych prowadzi do zaniku inicjatywy oddolnej. Rozpatrując różne płaszczyzny działania przedsiębiorstwa, Autorzy wykazują, że wymóg ten nie jest w dalekim stopniu spełniony.

Ocena efektywności w skali makro prowadzona jest z punktu widzenia selektywności instrumentów zarządzania, równowagi gospodarczej, promowania innowacji i zdolności systemu do integrowania pracowników.